

Jonathan Edwards and the Transatlantic World of Books

Peter J. Thuesen

Abstract

The following is the inaugural lecture delivered at the opening of the Jonathan Edwards Center Germany in the Heidelberg Center for American Studies at Ruprecht-Karls-Universität Heidelberg on July 11, 2012. Edwards' two manuscript book lists (his "Catalogue" and "Account Book"), along with the many book references in his other writings, reveal a bibliographical universe that was profoundly transatlantic and thus inextricably linked to European developments. The lecture makes five points regarding the transatlantic nature of Edwards' book world: (1) Edwards' native theological language was the scholasticism of post-Reformation Reformed orthodoxy. (2) Edwards' entire career was defined by the tension between Reformed orthodoxy and Enlightenment latitude. (3) Edwards was an eager participant in two transatlantic republics of letters—one secular, one evangelical. (4) Edwards' worldview was deeply colored by European politics. (5) We have more to learn about Edwards and his books.

In 1880, the American Congregational minister and editor Lyman Abbott compiled an advice book, *Hints for Home Reading*, which included the following observation:

[B]ooks are the most telling furniture which can be placed in a room. Every visitor of intelligence is immediately, irresistibly attracted to the perusal of their titles; and an opinion is formed at once, from them of the taste and cultivation of the family.¹

Abbott was directing his advice at would-be homemakers, but his words ring true for scholars of the history of the book and of intellectual history more broadly. Books reveal the concerns and the tastes of an age. Books reveal intellectual antecedents. Another famous American, Abraham Lincoln, made the latter point when he said that "books serve to show a man that those original thoughts of his aren't very new, after all."²

If books are the most telling furniture in a room, then what do Jonathan Edwards' books tell us? What do they reveal about his concerns and tastes? What do they reveal about his intellectual antecedents? Sadly, we can no longer browse Edwards' actual library. Save for a small collection of his books at Princeton University, most of his personal collection has been scattered far and wide among research libraries and rare book dealers.³

¹ Lyman Abbott, ed, *Hints for Home Reading: A Series of Chapters on Books and Their Use* (New York: G. P. Putnam's Sons, 1880), 112.

² Quoted in Michael Burlingame, *Abraham Lincoln: A Life*, 2 vols. (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2008), 1:573.

³ The Princeton collection is inventoried in Howard C. Rice, Jr., "Jonathan Edwards at Princeton: With a Survey of Edwards Materials in the Princeton University Library," *Princeton University Library Chronicle* 15-16

We must therefore reconstruct Edwards' book world through indirect means. The most obvious way is by searching his manuscripts for mentions of books. His treatises, and occasionally his sermons, contain hundreds of book references. But two manuscripts in particular reveal his reading interests more directly. In 1722, at the age of nineteen, Edwards began a manuscript he called his "Catalogue," which is a running list of book interests—books he hoped to acquire, and in some cases, eventually did acquire. Keeping such a "Catalogue" was not uncommon among intellectuals of the time, and Edwards maintained his for the rest of his life.⁴ The manuscript ultimately grew to 720 entries, many of them containing multiple book references. The other manuscript record of Edwards' book interests is his "Account Book," which lists books he lent to family, friends, and ministerial colleagues. Unlike the "Catalogue," which is often a wish list, the "Account Book" reveals books Edwards actually owned and used. We can even track how often he lent certain titles.⁵

Together, the "Catalogue" and "Account Book," along with the bibliographic citations culled from Edwards' other manuscripts, furnish us an unparalleled view of Edwards' personal book world and of the wider print culture of eighteenth-century America. Judging from these documents, how might we characterize the bibliographic universe that Edwards' inhabited?

Simply put, Edwards' book world was profoundly transatlantic. If we were to remove the complex web of connections linking him to the British Isles and Continental Europe—connections involving economic, political, cultural, and intellectual life—his book world would almost completely disappear. Indeed, there is very little in Edwards' book world that is not European in some way. Even the domestically printed titles in his reading lists (books printed mostly in Boston) were often deeply enmeshed in transatlantic controversies.

A brief aside here on the notion of *transatlantic*. The current popularity of Atlantic history as a subfield, as evident in recent work by Bernard Bailyn, Jack Greene, Philip Morgan, and others, has not been without its critics.⁶ Peter Coclanis, for one, has charged that Atlantic history is "one of those rare ideas that [has] moved swiftly from obscurity to

(1953-55): 69-89. See also "Appendix C: Books with Edwards' Autograph or Handwritten Notes," in *The Works of Jonathan Edwards*, 26, *Catalogues of Books*, ed. Peter J. Thuesen (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2008), 423-27. *The Works of Jonathan Edwards* hereafter cited *WJE* vol. no.: page no.

⁴ Edwards' grandfather, Solomon Stoddard, and Yale tutor Samuel Johnson, for example, each kept a book list entitled "Catalogue." See Norman S. Fiering, "Solomon Stoddard's Library at Harvard in 1664," *Harvard Library Bulletin* 20 (1972): 255-69, esp. 256; and *Samuel Johnson, President of King's College: His Career and Writings*, 1, *Autobiography and Letters*, ed. Herbert and Carol Schneider (New York: Columbia University Press, 1929), 495-526.

⁵ For more detailed descriptions of both the "Catalogue" and the "Account Book," see Thuesen, "Editor's Introduction," *WJE* 26: 2-3, 13-20, 28-36, 107-111.

⁶ Bernard Bailyn, *Atlantic History: Concept and Contours* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 2005); Jack P. Greene and Philip D. Morgan, eds., *Atlantic History: A Critical Appraisal* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2009).

meaninglessness without any intervening period of coherence.”⁷ Coclanis’s beef is that an Atlantic focus artificially limits our vision, blinding us to the influence of Asia, for example, in the rise of European and American economies.⁸ Valid as this point may be for economic history, I would argue that in the realm of intellectual history, Jonathan Edwards’ book lists offer striking confirmation of the Atlantic thesis—the notion that in the early modern world, the Atlantic became, to use D. W. Meinig’s phrase, the “inland sea of Western civilization,” a new Mediterranean characterized by a constant interchange of books and ideas.⁹

In what ways was Edwards’ book world—and by extension, his intellectual world—profoundly transatlantic? Where do we see European texts and ideas shaping his thought, and conversely, where do we see Edwards aspiring to influence his European counterparts? I want to make five points about the transatlantic nature of Edwards’ book world. I shall list them first and then discuss each in relation to the transatlantic theme: (1) Edwards’ native theological language was the scholasticism of post-Reformation Reformed orthodoxy. (2) Edwards’ entire career was defined by the tension between Reformed orthodoxy and Enlightenment latitude. (3) Edwards was an eager participant in two transatlantic republics of letters—one secular, one evangelical. (4) Edwards’ worldview was deeply colored by European politics. (5) We have more to learn about Edwards and his books.

1. Edwards’ native theological language was the scholasticism of post-Reformation Reformed orthodoxy.

By post-Reformation Reformed Orthodoxy, I mean the theology of the Protestant scholastics who hailed primarily from the English-, Dutch-, and German-speaking parts of Europe and who communicated with each other in a common scholarly language, Latin, between the last half of the sixteenth century and the first half of the eighteenth century. Edwards’ theological world was not narrowly Puritan. The Puritan theologians were in fact a subset of the Protestant scholastics. The leading expert on this Protestant scholastic theological world, Richard Muller, has identified three phases of the movement: *early orthodoxy* (from 1565 to 1640), when the great post-Reformation Protestant confessions were written; *high orthodoxy* (from 1640 to 1725), when the theologians further defined their positions against a series of adversaries; and *late orthodoxy* (the period after 1725), when Enlightenment thought led to new ways of thinking and ultimately to the disintegration of Protestant orthodoxy as a recognizable theological method. I mention Muller’s typology because many of the figures identified by him in all three periods are central to Edwards’ own theological reading list: early orthodox figures such as William Ames, William Perkins, and the divines who gathered at Dort and Westminster; high orthodox figures such as Stephen Charnock, John Edwards, Peter van Mastricht, John Owen, Matthew Poole,

⁷ Quoted in Philip D. Morgan and Jack P. Greene, “Introduction: The Present State of Atlantic History,” in Greene and Morgan, eds., *Atlantic History*, 5.

⁸ See Peter A. Coclanis, “Beyond Atlantic History,” in Greene and Morgan, eds., *Atlantic History*, 337–56.

⁹ D. W. Meinig, *The Shaping of America: A Geographical Perspective on 500 Years of History*, 1, *Atlantic America*, 1492–1800 (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1986), 65, quoted in Bailyn, *Atlantic History*, 55.

Thomas Ridgley, Francis Turretin, and Hermann Witsius; and late orthodox figures such as John Gill and Johann Friedrich Stapfer.¹⁰

The only corrective I would offer to Muller's picture of post-Reformation Protestant scholasticism is that it should be seen as a *transatlantic* movement. In other words, the Americans are missing from Muller's list—people such as Samuel Willard, Cotton Mather, and, above all, Jonathan Edwards. These Americans were conversant in the theological *lingua franca* (Latin) and regarded their European counterparts as standard sources in the field. Thus Willard based his *Compleat Body of Divinity*, the first truly systematic theology published in America, on an early orthodox work, the Westminster Assembly's Shorter Catechism.¹¹ Later on, Mather, in his advice book to young ministers, said that there was nothing he could recommend with such assurance as Peter van Mastricht, whom he praised as “the Store-house to which you may resort continually.”¹² Edwards echoed Mather's advice in a letter to Joseph Bellamy. Though Edwards noted that Francis Turretin was better on polemical divinity, “take Mastricht,” he wrote, “for divinity in general . . . or as a universal system of divinity; . . . it is much better than Turretin or any other book in the world, excepting the Bible in my opinion.”¹³

It is worth noting here that seventeenth-century Protestant orthodox figures such as Turretin, Mastricht, and Witsius, and eighteenth-century figures such as Stapfer, occur far more frequently in Edwards' manuscripts than Calvin and the other sixteenth-century reformers. This does not mean that Edwards never read Calvin: he cites the *Institutes* three times in *Religious Affections*, and we may assume that in many matters, Calvin's authority was simply taken for granted in New England.¹⁴ But Edwards' theological world was transatlantic in a way that Calvin could not have imagined. Reformed Protestant intellectuals in both the Old World and the New participated in the joint project of building a school theology—a new scholasticism—that they hoped would withstand the challenges of competing systems of thought. Little did the early orthodox theologians realize how large one of these competing systems would loom by the time of late orthodox thinkers such as Edwards.

2. Edwards' entire career was defined by the tension between Reformed orthodoxy and Enlightenment latitude.

By the time of the late orthodox period (after 1725), one system of thought had emerged as the most threatening rival to Reformed scholasticism—the intellectual current I

¹⁰ Richard A. Muller, *Post-Reformation Reformed Dogmatics: The Rise and Development of Reformed Orthodoxy, ca. 1520 to ca. 1725*, 1, *Prolegomena to Theology*, 2nd ed. (Grand Rapids: Baker Academic, 2003), 30–32.

¹¹ Samuel Willard, *A Compleat Body of Divinity in Two Hundred and Fifty Expository Lectures on the Assembly's Shorter Catechism* (Boston, 1726).

¹² Cotton Mather, *Manuductio ad Ministerium: Directions for a Candidate of the Ministry* (Boston, 1726), 85.

¹³ Jonathan Edwards to Joseph Bellamy, 15 January 1747, in *WJE* 16:217.

¹⁴ Thuesen, “Editor's Introduction,” *WJE* 26:56–7.

am calling Enlightenment latitude. In reality, it was not a tightly argued system but more of an attitude, a new skepticism about rigid orthodoxies and a growing indifference toward old doctrinal controversies. In England, Latitudinarianism flourished after the Restoration as part of a wider anti-Puritan backlash. It emphasized moderation and tolerance as antidotes to the partisan strife that had so long characterized English religious life. It also tended toward an Arminian confidence in human ability and entailed a strong interest in natural religion, or the knowledge of God revealed through nature and human reason. By the late seventeenth century, prominent Latitudinarians in the Anglican hierarchy included none other than the archbishop of Canterbury, John Tillotson, whose sermons remained bestsellers decades after his death in 1694. Among Tillotson's admirers was John Locke, whose *Reasonableness of Christianity* (1695) likewise revealed a Latitudinarian temper. Other figures who exemplified the Latitudinarian perspective included the Cambridge Platonists Ralph Cudworth and Henry More, the Anglican bishop Benjamin Hoadly, the philosopher Samuel Clarke, and the politicians and essayists Joseph Addison, Sir Richard Steele, and Anthony Ashley Cooper, third earl of Shaftesbury. By the early eighteenth century, the polite, Latitudinarian style was so pervasive in the Church of England that the once-triumphant Calvinism of the Puritan revolution had virtually disappeared as an effective force in English life.¹⁵

But Latitudinarian ideas, though well-worn in London—and even in Boston—by the early eighteenth century, were still avoided at Yale, where Jonathan Edwards attended college, until Jeremiah Dummer, London agent for the Massachusetts and Connecticut colonies, gave the college more than eight hundred books covering every major branch of learning. Edwards had the opportunity to use the collection in the early 1720s during his years as a master's degree candidate and tutor. Indeed, he and the other tutors received an extra stipend for sorting the books, which Dummer had collected from individual donors, many of them prominent figures, including Richard Steele and Isaac Newton, who contributed some of their own works. Not only did the gift introduce Yale students to the thought of Locke but it also contained a generous sampling of such polite figures as Clarke, More, Shaftesbury, and Tillotson. The collection also featured such Enlightenment classics as Robert Boyle's scientific works, Nicolas Malebranche's *Search after Truth*, and Pierre Bayle's four-volume *Historical and Critical Dictionary*.¹⁶ All of these works show up in Edwards' books lists and as actual citations in his later manuscripts.

Fortunately for Edwards' relationship with his family, his encounter with the Dummer collection did not lead him into the kind of apostasy that the books inspired in seven other

¹⁵ On Latitudinarianism and its influence, see, among others, Ned C. Landsman, *From Colonials to Provincials: American Thought and Culture, 1680-1760* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1997), 63-71; and W. M. Spellman, *The Latitudinarians and the Church of England, 1660-1700* (Athens: University of Georgia Press, 1993).

¹⁶ This section on the importance of the Dummer books is from Thuesen, "Editor's Introduction," *WJE* 26:8-13, q.v. for additional notes on sources. For an inventory of the Dummer gift, see Louise May Bryant and Mary Patterson, "The List of Books Sent by Jeremiah Dummer," along with the historical article by Anne Stokely Pratt, "The Books Sent from England by Jeremiah Dummer to Yale College," in *Papers in Honor of Andrew Keogh* (New Haven: Yale University Library, 1938), 7-44, 423-92.

local clergy, who converted en masse to Anglicanism. (Their very public defection—prompted by such books as Bishop Hoadly’s *Reasonableness of Conformity to the Church of England*—is infamous in the annals of New England. Its effect, according to Henry F. May, was similar to that which might have been produced in the twentieth century if the entire Yale football team had suddenly joined the Communist Party.)¹⁷ Edwards’ encounter with the Dummer books was hugely important for his intellectual development, however, in that it established a lifelong pattern of serious wrestling with European Enlightenment sources. Indeed, the tension between the older Reformed orthodoxy and the newer rationalism and Latitudinarianism of the Enlightenment proved the intellectual catalyst for his entire career as a theologian. Unlike some of his evangelical contemporaries who saw Reformed orthodoxy and Enlightenment latitude as irreconcilable, Edwards hoped to synthesize them, or at least take them both seriously, in a new theology that he planned to set forth in, among other writings, the treatise he titled *A Rational Account of the Main Doctrines of the Christian Religion Attempted*.¹⁸ Though he never finished this project, Edwards spent his whole career reaching across the Atlantic for the latest in European Enlightenment thought. As he once wrote to a Scottish correspondent in reference to his reading of the philosopher David Hume: “I am glad of an opportunity to read such corrupt books; especially when written by men of considerable genius; that I may have an idea of the notions that prevail in our nation.”¹⁹ (Notice here too that by “our nation,” Edwards clearly means Great Britain as a transatlantic entity.) Contrast this inquiring attitude with that of Edwards’ contemporary George Whitefield, who after a 1740 visit to Harvard, famously complained that “Tillotson and Clark[e] are read instead of Shepard, Stoddard, and suchlike evangelical writers.”²⁰ For Edwards, the tension between the “suchlike evangelical writers” and the luminaries of the Enlightenment was the source of his creativity as a thinker.

3. Edwards was an eager participant in two transatlantic republics of letters—one secular, one evangelical.

Much has been made by historians of the so-called “republic of letters,” the polite, eighteenth-century culture of reciprocity and exchange in which intellectuals and persons of leisure shared books, and ideas about books, among themselves. Princeton historian Anthony Grafton, in his recent presidential address to the American Historical Association, chronicled the participation of the Pennsylvania German settler Francis Daniel Pastorius in this culture of what Grafton calls “cosmopolitan erudition.”²¹ Edwards was every bit as

¹⁷ Henry F. May, *The Enlightenment in America* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1976), 77.

¹⁸ On the background and content of this treatise, see Michael J. McClymond and Gerald R. McDermott, eds., *The Theology of Jonathan Edwards* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2012), 164–66.

¹⁹ Jonathan Edwards to John Erskine, 11 December 1755, in *WJE* 16:679.

²⁰ Quoted in Norman Fiering, “The First American Enlightenment: Tillotson, Leverett, and Philosophical Anglicanism,” *New England Quarterly* 54 (1981): 307–44, quotation on 307–8.

²¹ Anthony Grafton, “The Republic of Letters in the American Colonies: Francis Daniel Pastorius Makes a Notebook,” *American Historical Review* 117 (2012): 1–39, quotation on 39.

immersed in this culture as the erudite layperson Pastorius. In navigating the world of polite letters, Edwards relied heavily on literary periodicals published in London for information about new books. These included the *London Magazine*, which featured a “Monthly Catalogue” of books at the end of every issue, and *The Present State of the Republick of Letters*, a periodical which billed itself as “a general view of the state of learning throughout Europe.”²² Edwards cited book recommendations from these periodicals more than thirty times in his own “Catalogue.” He also combed bound editions of older periodicals such as Addison and Steele’s Whiggish journal *The Guardian* for additional book references.²³ All the while, Edwards burned with ambition to make it big as an author in this polite London literary world. In a memorandum to himself during his Yale tutorship, he wrote: “Before I venture to publish in London, . . . make some experiment in my own country; . . . play at small games first, that I may gain some experience in writing.”²⁴

At the same time, Edwards was a pioneer in what we might call an *evangelical* republic of letters in which the leading advocates of religious revival on both sides of the Atlantic exchanged books and ideas.²⁵ Edwards’ leading contacts were in Scotland, where revivals occurred in 1742 that paralleled the Awakening in New England. His most important source was the Scottish divine John Erskine, seventeen years his junior, who was influenced by Edwards’ writings and became for him a regular conduit not only of bibliographical tips but also of actual books and pamphlets. Surviving correspondence between the two men shows that between 1746 and 1757, Edwards received dozens of books from Erskine. Though these exchanges were usually one-sided—Edwards had far less access to books on the Massachusetts frontier than Erskine enjoyed in his successive parishes near Glasgow and Edinburgh—Edwards did not miss an opportunity to return a favor. As Edwards wrote to Erskine in 1748: “I have herewith sent the two books of Mr. [Solomon] Stoddard’s you desired. The lesser of the two was my own; and though I have no other, you have laid me under such obligations, that I am glad I have it to send to you.”²⁶ Such were the rules of reciprocity between two gentlemen in the republic of letters.

As Edwards’ own works began to be published and exchanged in the evangelical republic of letters, Edwards realized an additional benefit for his book-collecting habits: he sometimes obtained information about new books from advertisements printed at the end of his own works. During his lifetime, his sermons and treatises appeared in print not only in Boston but also in London, Edinburgh, Glasgow, Bristol, Amsterdam, Utrecht, Magdeburg, and Leipzig. The lack of modern copyright restrictions was partly responsible for this

²² *The London Magazine; or, Gentleman’s Monthly Intelligencer* (London, 1732-1783); *The Present State of the Republick of Letters* (London, 1728-1736). On the influence of such periodicals, see Norman S. Fiering, “The Transatlantic Republic of Letters: A Note on the Circulation of Learned Periodicals to Early Eighteenth-Century America,” *William and Mary Quarterly*, 3rd ser., 33 (1976): 642-60.

²³ *The Guardian* (London, 1713); see Thuesen, “Editor’s Introduction,” *WJE* 26:20-23.

²⁴ Jonathan Edwards, “Natural Philosophy,” cover-leaf memoranda, in *WJE* 6:194.

²⁵ Thuesen, “Editor’s Introduction,” *WJE* 26:24-25.

²⁶ Jonathan Edwards to John Erskine, 31 August 1748, in *WJE* 16:249.

proliferation, and Edwards himself may never have seen the Dutch- and German-language editions. But he did see the British versions, so when the second edition of his *Faithful Narrative* appeared in London in 1738 with two pages of book notices printed at the end, he inserted references to four of the advertised titles in his “Catalogue.”²⁷

A final evangelical source of book information was the genre popularized by Cotton Mather in America and the staunch English Calvinist John Edwards (no relation to Jonathan)—the advice manual for ministers. Jonathan Edwards obtained many bibliographical recommendations from Mather’s *Manuductio ad Ministerium* (1726) and John Edwards’ earlier book *The Preacher* (1707). Mather’s *Manuductio* was especially rich in book references, which were often flavored with his caustic wit. Jonathan Edwards cited Mather’s recommendations ten times in the “Catalogue” and probably relied on Mather’s advice in other instances.²⁸ Similarly, Jonathan Edwards listed John Edwards’ *Preacher* in a “Catalogue” entry (no. 200) in 1724 and probably mined its book recommendations, which included a number of titles by John Edwards himself. (John Edwards was a little like the disgraced U.S. presidential candidate of the same name in that they both had a weakness for self-promotion!) Edwards mentioned five additional works by John Edwards in the “Catalogue,” including the two-volume *Theologia Reformata*, which, as its long subtitle explains, was designed to be “an antidote in this corrupted age against the dangerous opinions of Papists, Arians and Socinians, Pelagians and Remonstrants, Anabaptists, Antinomians, Deists, Atheists, Scepticks, Enthusiasts, [and] Libertines.”²⁹ John Edwards himself donated this two-volume tome as part of the Dummer gift to the Yale Library, where Jonathan Edwards probably found it to be a gold mine of indirect information on the evangelicals’ Enlightenment opponents.

4. Edwards’ worldview was deeply colored by European politics.

Ever since Alan Heimert’s landmark study, *Religion and the American Mind*, scholars have debated whether, as Heimert argued, the Calvinist revivals of the Great Awakening contributed significantly to the ideology of the American Revolution.³⁰ Though Edwards’

²⁷ “Catalogue” entry nos. 378, 386, 412, and 416 in *WJE* 26.

²⁸ “Catalogue” entry nos. 221, 287, 327–31, 345, 348, and 418 in *WJE* 26.

²⁹ John Edwards, *Theologia Reformata; or, The Body and Substance of the Christian Religion, Comprised in Distinct Discourses or Treatises upon the Apostles Creed, the Lord’s Prayer, and the Ten Commandments. The Whole Adjusted to the Sacred Scriptures, and the Judgment of the Protestant Reformed Churches, Our Own More Especially; and Design’d as an Antidote in this Corrupted Age against the Dangerous Opinions of Papists, Arians and Socinians, Pelagians and Remonstrants, Anabaptists, Antinomians, Deists, Atheists, Scepticks, Enthusiasts, Libertines. All Endeavoured to be so Fram’d as to Be Useful not only to Profess’d Students in Divinity, but to All that Are Lovers of Divine Knowledge, and Desire to Make Farther Proficiency in It*, 2 vols. (London, 1713). See discussion in Thuesen, “Editor’s Introduction,” *WJE* 26:26–27, 54.

³⁰ Alan Heimert, *Religion and the American Mind, from the Great Awakening to the Revolution* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1966). For an overview of the debate, see Philip Goff, “Revivals and Revolution: Historiographic Turns since Alan Heimert’s *Religion and the American Mind*,” *Church History* 67 (1998): 695–721.

“Catalogue” and “Account Book” do not settle this issue, they make abundantly clear how thoroughly European imperial politics affected Edwards’ worldview. Two events that occurred in England before Edwards’ birth still reverberated throughout his career years later: the Restoration of the British monarchy in 1660 and the overthrow of England’s last Catholic king in the Glorious Revolution of 1688. In the wake of the Restoration, with the Act of Uniformity of 1662, clergy who refused to conform to the Church of England were ejected from their posts. Not since the persecution under Mary Tudor had zealous Protestants suffered such an upheaval. The principal dissenting groups were the Independents (known in America as the Congregationalists), the Presbyterians, and the Particular Baptists. They shared a Calvinist theology and a profound sense of political grievance. Their chief propagandist was Edmund Calamy, an English Presbyterian and the son and grandson of ejected ministers, who compiled hundreds of biographical sketches of deprived clergy in a popular account issued in 1702 and expanded in 1713 and 1727.³¹ Calamy himself donated copies of the first two editions to the Yale Library as part of the Dummer Collection, and Edwards listed the volumes twice early in the “Catalogue.”³² More striking, Edwards’ manuscripts are full of references to books by Calamy’s ejected ministers: at least eighteen appear in the “Catalogue” (two of them, Thomas Manton and John Owen, multiple times), and at least six appear in the “Account Book.”³³ Edwards thus internalized a deep distrust of established churches—not establishments *per se* (which he still took for granted), but establishments of the wrong kind.³⁴

The Glorious Revolution of 1688, and the Act of Toleration the following year, restored some of the earlier rights of the ejected ministers. But the Revolution imprinted something bigger in Edwards’ mind: the fear of an international Catholic conspiracy. British Protestants on both sides of the Atlantic had celebrated what they regarded as the overthrow the papal Antichrist in England when the Dutch prince William of Orange-Nassau invaded the country and toppled the Catholic James II. The esteem in which this event was held in the colonies is evident in the name of the college town where Edwards briefly served as president: Princeton, named for the Prince of Orange. Likewise, the college’s building was dubbed Nassau Hall, a tribute (as a broadside in 1755 proclaimed) to “the great Deliverer of the British Nation from those two monstrous Furies, Popery and

³¹ Edmund Calamy, *An Abridgment of Mr. Baxter’s History of His Life and Times: With an Account of Many Others of Those Worthy Ministers Who Were Ejected after the Restoration of King Charles the Second . . .* (London, 1702; 2nd ed., 2 vols., London, 1713); *A Continuation of the Account of the Ministers . . .*, 2 vols. (London, 1727). See David L. Wykes, “‘To Let the Memory of These Men Dye Is Injurious to Posterity’: Edmund Calamy’s *Account* of the Ejected Ministers,” in *Studies in Church History*, 33, *The Church Retrospective*, ed. R. N. Swanson (Woodbridge: Boydell Press, 1997): 379–92.

³² “Catalogue” entry nos. 81 and 202 in *WJE* 26.

³³ See the list in Thuesen, “Editor’s Introduction,” *WJE* 26:53.

³⁴ Thuesen, “Editor’s Introduction,” *WJE* 26:52–53.

Slavery.”³⁵ Yet the prospect of a resurgent popery—abetted particularly by French imperial interests—was always a concern, particularly in the wake of series of Jacobite plots to reclaim the British throne for the exiled James and his successors.³⁶ Much of Edwards’ political book world is frankly unintelligible to us today without knowledge of these plots as background.

Early in the “Catalogue,” for example, in 1724, Edwards made four cryptic notions that reveal the political intrigue of the time: “Against Captain Kelly,” “penalties Commons Against Roches[ter],” “Bp. of Rochester a double Guard,” and “Dr friend Committed to tower.”³⁷ All are references to publications stemming from the Atterbury Plot, an abortive Jacobite military scheme in 1722 to replace George I with the Old Pretender (the son of James II). Among the conspirators were Francis Atterbury (the bishop of Rochester), George Kelly (an agent for the exiled Stuarts), and John Freind (a physician and chemist); all three were arrested and imprisoned in the Tower of London. The Atterbury Plot was one of no fewer than five Jacobite plots during Edwards’ lifetime to reinstall a Stuart monarch on the English throne.³⁸ The most famous of the attempts was of course the so-called “Forty-Five”—the Jacobite Rising of 1745—which resulted in the massacre of more than 1,000 Jacobites at Culloden Moor in Scotland. The “Account Book” reveals that Edwards circulated four different publications associated with this event. After learning of the defeat of the Young Pretender (“Bonnie Prince Charlie”), Edwards wrote to his Scottish correspondent John MacLaurin: “[W]e, and all Protestants, have great cause of thankfulness; especially all within the British dominions.”³⁹ Surely, Edwards reasoned, the suppression of the rebellion was a sign that God, in his good providence, would ultimately defeat the forces of popery. Accordingly, the following year, in 1747, Edwards began keeping a list, based on newspaper accounts, of world events he believed fulfilled the pouring out of the “sixth vial” of God’s wrath foretold by Revelation 16:12. Like the drying up of the river Euphrates predicted by this verse, the revenue and influence of the Catholic Church, Edwards believed, were beginning to evaporate. On the first page of the manuscript, Edwards copied a *Boston Gazette* report from Vienna of a Jesuit library—“one of the best-chosen and most curious in Europe,” as he put it—that was struck by lightning and reduced to ashes. The paradox of Edwards the book lover celebrating the destruction of a

³⁵ “To His Excellency Jonathan Belcher, Esq: Captain General, and Governor in Chief of the Province of Nova-Caesarea, or New-Jersey, Chancellor, and Vice-Admiral in the Same. An Address from the Trustees of the College of New-Jersey” (n.p., 1755), quoted in Thuesen, “Editor’s Introduction,” *WJE* 26:49.

³⁶ On fears of Jacobitism in colonial New England, see Thomas S. Kidd, *The Protestant Interest: New England after Puritanism* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2004), esp. 115-35.

³⁷ “Catalogue” entry nos. 175, 176, 178, 181 in *WJE* 26.

³⁸ Thuesen, “Editor’s Introduction,” *WJE* 26:19-20, 87-89.

³⁹ Jonathan Edwards to John MacLaurin, 12 May 1746, in *WJE* 16:204.

great library revealed his confidence that the papal Antichrist was steadily being deprived of his riches.⁴⁰

Yet within a few years of Edwards' move to Stockbridge, the specter of popery—and with it, French imperial domination—had emerged again with the outbreak of the Seven Years' War. The crushing defeat of General Edward Braddock at Fort Duquesne (what is today Pittsburgh) in 1755 reminded the colonists of the tribulations that must be endured before God's ultimate vindication of his elect. Let us not forget that Edwards lived his last years in wartime amid a conflict of truly transatlantic proportions and complexity. It is no coincidence that the very term "Atlantic," which, as Joyce Chaplin has shown, previously had appeared only rarely in print, began to be used more frequently during Seven Years' War as the British consolidated their control over North America, the Caribbean, and the Atlantic Ocean.⁴¹

5. We have more to learn about Edwards and his books.

I can make this last point more briefly—and with a personal anecdote. I spent the better part of a decade, through jobs at three different universities, working on deciphering, annotating, and analyzing Edwards' "Catalogue" and "Account Book." Just as my volume in the Edwards edition was going to press, when I thought my work was almost done, a historian colleague discovered by accident a missing leaf of the "Account Book" tipped into another book at the Huntington Library in San Marino, California. The missing leaf contained more than a dozen additional book references, six of them cited nowhere else in the "Account Book" or the "Catalogue." This is a reminder that we do not know all there is to know about Edwards and his reading. In fact, there are five remaining manuscript lacunae in the "Account Book" totaling 36 numbered manuscript pages.⁴² Where these pages ended up is anybody's guess. Maybe they are in the possession of private collectors. Or perhaps they are waiting to be found in libraries or rare book shops. One thing is certain: the discovery of more missing manuscript leaves could yet enlarge our understanding of Edwards' intellectual interests and ambitions.

On a broader level, we have yet to realize the full promise of transatlantic history as a way of understanding the intellectual life of the early modern world. We know that the transatlantic connections in the lives of Edwards and his contemporaries were legion, but pursuing all of these leads requires time, patience, travel funding, and, maybe most important, knowledge of languages. Historian David Wills made this point almost two

⁴⁰ "An Account of Events Probably Fulfilling the Sixth Vial," in *WJE* 5:253; Thuesen, "Editor's Introduction," *WJE* 26:46-47. See also George M. Marsden, *Jonathan Edwards: A Life* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2003), 337-38.

⁴¹ Joyce E. Chaplin, "The Atlantic Ocean and Its Contemporary Meanings, 1492-1808," in Greene and Morgan, eds., *Atlantic History*, 45. On the effect of Braddock's defeat and the Seven Years' War on Edwards' worldview, see Marsden, *Jonathan Edwards*, 414-31.

⁴² On the Huntington Library leaf and the remaining lacunae, see Thuesen, "Editor's Introduction," *WJE* 26:110.

decades ago in a state-of-the-field essay in the journal we publish at IUPUI, *Religion and American Culture*. To understand the Atlantic world in all its linguistic and cultural complexity, as he put it, “will tax the scholarly resources of American religious historians to their limits.”⁴³ Fortunately, there are linguistically talented scholars who are rising to the challenge. Among them is my IUPUI faculty colleague Rachel Wheeler, whose patient deciphering of handwritten German records made by Moravian missionaries has opened whole new worlds of transatlantic encounters.⁴⁴ And there is the work being done by polyglot Europeans in research institutes such as the Heidelberg Center for American Studies. What European scholars have always known—and what we Americans have been slower to appreciate—is that no country is an island. The old picture of Jonathan Edwards as an isolated genius toiling in his study on the Massachusetts frontier is in part a romantic fiction. He may have been a genius, but he was not isolated. The books in his study are proof of that.

⁴³ David W. Wills, “Forum: The Decade Ahead in Scholarship,” *Religion and American Culture: A Journal of Interpretation* 3 (1993): 21.

⁴⁴ Rachel Wheeler, *To Live Upon Hope: Mohicans and Missionaries in the Eighteenth-Century Northeast* (Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell University Press, 2008).

Jonathan Edwards was born in East Windsor, Connecticut, on October 5, 1703. Sited on the Connecticut River, East Windsor was still frontier, where worshipers carried muskets to church. Edwards was the only boy among ten sisters, but there were seven boy cousins living next door and a number of boys attending school under Edwards's father, the Reverend Timothy Edwards. Educated by his father, Edwards was a precocious boy who was ready for college at the age of thirteen. When he was eleven, he wrote a paper on flying spiders that is remarkable for both its scientific observation and its literary By Jonathan M. Yeager. New York: Oxford University Press, 2016. xv + 234 pp. \$74.00 cloth. | Jonathan Edwards and Transatlantic Print Culture. By Jonathan M. Yeager. New York: Oxford University Press, 2016. xv + 234 pp. \$74.00 cloth. - | Find, read and cite all the research you need on ResearchGate.Â DINA LE GALL, A Culture of Sufism: Naqshbandis in the Ottoman World, 1450â€“1700 (Albany, N.Y.: State